

Meeting Minutes

Franklin Municipal Planning Commission

CALL TO ORDER

Present 7 - Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Chairperson Hathaway, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison

Absent 2 - Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen

MINUTES

1. Approval of the February 23, 2017 FMPC Minutes

Attachments: Draft MeetingMinutes 2-23-2017

Alderman Petersen moved, seconded by Commissioner Harrison to approve the February 23, 2017, Minutes as presented. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 7 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Chairperson Hathaway, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Chairing: 0

CITIZEN COMMENTS ON ITEMS NOT ON THE AGENDA

Chair Hathaway asked for citizen comments. There were none.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Hathaway asked for announcements from Staff. There were none.

VOTE TO PLACE NON-AGENDA ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

Chair Hathaway asked if there were any non-agenda items to be presented. There were none.

CONSENT AGENDA

Approval of the Consent Agenda

Alderman Petersen requested that Item 9 be pulled from the consent agenda and placed on the regular agenda. Chair Hathaway asked for any discussion. There was none.

A motion was made by Commissioner Harrison, seconded by Commissioner McLemore, to approve Items 2,3.4,5, and 13 on the Initial Consent Agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 7 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Chairperson Hathaway, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Chairing: 0

Approval of the Consent Agenda

Chair Hathaway recused himself and passed the Chair to Vice-Chair Lindsey.

A motion was made by Commissioner Harrison, seconded by Commissioner Orr, to approve Items 11,12, and 14 on the Secondary Consent Agenda. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 6 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Recused: 1 Chairperson Hathaway
- Chairing: 0

SITE PLAN SURETIES

2.	Berry Farms Town Center PUD Subdivision, site plan, section 1, revision 1, lot 62 (Amenity Center); release the maintenance agreement for drainage improvements. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	This Planning Item was approved.
3.	Franklin Park Subdivision, site plan, (Open Space Lot/Parkland/Infrastructure); extend the performance agreement for sidewalks improvements. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	This Planning Item was approved.
4.	Medcore Medical Building Subdivision, site plan, lot 2 (HealthSouth Rehab Center); release the maintenance agreement for sewer improvements. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	This Planning Item was approved.

5. Rizer Point PUD Subdivision, site plan, section 1; release the maintenance agreement for streets improvements; extend the performance agreement for sidewalks improvements. (CONSENT AGENDA)

This Planning Item was approved.

REZONINGS AND DEVELOPMENT PLANS

- PUBLIC HEARING: Consideration of Ordinance 2017-06, To Be Entitled: "An Ordinance To Rezone 4.66 Acres From Specific Development Variety (33.4/35000/115) District To Specific Development Variety (33.4/35000/119) District For The Property Located Within The Block Of 1st Avenue, Bridge Street, 2nd Avenue North And East Main Street (Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision)."; (3/23/17 FMPC 6-0, 04/11/17 1ST BOMA Reading 8-0) SECOND OF THREE READINGS
 - Attachments:
 ORD 2017-06HarpethSquarePUDRezoning with MapLaw Approved.pdf

 REZONEMAP_HarpethSquarePUDSubdivision_Rezone.pdf

 HarpethSquare Rezoning Revision 2-3.2.2017.pdf

Chair Hathaway recused himself from Item 6 and passed the Chair to Vice-Chair Lindsey.

Ms. Amy Diaz- Barriga stated that Ordinance 2017-06 will add four (4) additional hotel units to the existing Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision. She stated that no changes are proposed to the approved building footprint on the associated development plan.

Staff recommends a favorable recommendation to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for citizen comments. There were none.

Greg Gamble, Gamble Design, was there to represent the Applicant. Mr. Gamble stated he was available to answer any questions.

Chair Lindsey asked for a motion.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr, that Ordinance 2017-06 be recommended to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen for approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 6 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Recused: 1 Chairperson Hathaway

 PUBLIC HEARING: Consideration of Resolution 2017-14, To Be Entitled: "A Resolution Approving A Revised Development Plan For Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision, With 5 Existing Modifications Of Development Standards For The Property Located Within The Block Of 1st Avenue, Bridge Street, 2nd Avenue North And East Main Street."; (3/23/17 FMPC 6-0, 04/11/17 WS)

Attachments: MAP HarpethSquarePUDSubdivision.pdf

2017-14 RES Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision Rev 2_with MapLaw Approved.pdf 6356 Harpeth Square DP Revision 2 Conditions of Approval_01

Layout HarpethSquare.pdf

HarpethSquare_Arch.pdf

HarpethSquare DevelpPlan Rev2 3.2.2017.pdf

FULLSET_HarpethSquare DevelpPlan Rev2 3.2.2017.pdf

Chair Hathaway recused himself from Item 7 and passed the Chair to Vice-Chair Lindsey.

Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated the applicant is adding four additional hotel units to the existing hotel entitlements. The applicant is accomplishing this without modifying the existing footprint of the hotel or changing the elevations of the hotel.

Staff recommends a favorable recommendation to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked if the Modification of Standards was already approved. Ms. Diaz-Barriga confirmed that there were no changes being made.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for citizen comments. There were none.

Greg Gamble, Gamble Design, was there to represent the Applicant. Mr. Gamble stated that he was available to answer any questions.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for a motion.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr, that Resolution 2017-14 be recommended to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen for approval with conditions. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 6 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Recused: 1 Chairperson Hathaway

8.

PUBLIC HEARING: Consideration Of Resolution 2017-09, To Be Entitled: "A Resolution Approving A Revised Development Plan For Simmons Ridge PUD Subdivision, With One (1) Modification of Standards (Backing onto City Streets) For The Property Located East Of Carothers Parkway And North Of South Carothers Road."; (3/23/17 FMPC 6-0, 04/11/17 WS).

 Attachments:
 MAP_SimmonsRisgeDevPlan.pdf

 6339_Simmons Ridge DP_rev 4 Conditions of Approval_03

 2017-09_SimmonsRidgePUDSubdivisionRev4_with Map_Law_

 Approved(2).pdf

 LAYOUT_SimmonsRidge.pdf

 ARCH_SimmonsRidge.pdf

 Simmons Ridge Dev Rev 4 Resubmittal Set 3.2.2017.pdf

Vice-Chair Lindsey passed the chair to Chair Hathaway.

Commissioner Franks recused himself from Item 8.

Ms. Diaz- Barriga stated the Simmons Ridge Development Plan was originally approved by BOMA on November 23, 2010. This revision keeps the same number of units but adjusts the layout of the development to better preserve wetlands and a stream located on-site. Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated that an external access point along the northern property limits has also been relocated with this proposed revision, and a potential connection to Warren Road is being relocated to a more feasible location within the development. This proposed revision also adds a new housing type, an alley loaded single-family product, and adds a three-story option for the townhomes.

Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated there is a Modification of Standards (MOS-1: Backing onto public streets). With revision 2 of the Simmons Ridge PUD Subdivision Development Plan in 2012, a modification of standards was approved from Section 5.9.3 (4)(b) of the Zoning Ordinance to allow vehicles to back out of guest parking spaces proposed within this development onto City streets, with the condition that the off-street parking areas be set off from the traveled way by a rolled curb, be constructed of pervious pavers, and be maintained by the Homeowners Association. The application is requesting a revision to the condition that was placed on the originally-granted modification of standards to allow the parking spaces to be constructed of a pavement surface approved by the City Engineer, rather than strictly pervious pavers. The original intent of the pavers was to provide a parking surface that was distinguishable from the asphalt surfacing of the roadway.

Staff recommends approval of the revised Modification of Standards and favorable recommendation to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen with conditions of the PUD development plan.

Chairman Hathaway asked for citizen comments. There were none.

Greg Gamble, Gamble Design, was there to represent the Applicant. Mr. Gamble stated that he was available for questions.

Chair Hathaway stated they would start with the main motion.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr, to recommend approval to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen with Staff conditions.

Chair Hathaway stated the Modification of Standards would be addressed. The Modification of Standards would allow the parking spaces to be constructed of a pavement surface approved by the City Engineer, rather than strictly pervious pavers. Chair Hathaway asked if there was an amendment to that motion.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr, to approve the revision to the Modification of Standards.

Alderman Petersen stated that she did not have an objection changing the pavers because they did not work as well as other materials. Alderman Petersen stated she was concerned about citizens backing out of parking spaces onto city streets.

Chairman Hathaway stated the vote on the amendment would take place first.

The amendment to the Modification of Standards was approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with one abstention.

Alderman Petersen asked why "backing out" parking spaces would be allowed here.

Mr. Gamble stated that the design changes had been made and the number of perpendicular spaces had been greatly reduced.

Alderman Petersen stated that she did not think it was ever a good idea have parking spaces that required the driver to back out.

Commissioner Orr stated that this only concerned the subdivision streets. Alderman Petersen stated she would still not want anyone to have to back out in her own neighborhood.

Emily Hunter, Director of Planning and Sustainability, stated the Zoning Ordinance does not allow it, and that a Modification of Standards request was required originally. Any future request for this type of parking space would require a Modification of Standards.

Chair Hathaway stated they were back to the main motion as amended. The motion carried by a vote of 6 to 0, with one abstention.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr, that Resolution 2017-09, including one Modification of Standard (MOS 1: 6-0) be recommended to the Board of Mayor and Aldermen for approval. The motion carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 6 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Chairperson Hathaway, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
- Recused: 1 Commissioner Franks

SITE PLANS, PRELIMINARY PLATS, AND FINAL PLATS

9. 382 Natchez Street Subdivision, Final Plat, Recording Easements Associated With Properties Located At 370, 382, And 402 Natchez Street. (CONSENT AGENDA)

Attachments: MAP_382NatchezStreet.pdf

382NatchezSt-FinalPlat.pdf

Alderman Petersen requested that Item 9 be pulled from the consent agenda and placed on the regular agenda.

Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated this plat is recording a utility, access, and parking agreement for the property located at 382 Natchez Street. A site plan was approved administratively for 370 Natchez street in February of 2017. The parking easement/agreement covers the parcels located at 370, 402, and 382 Natchez Street.

Staff recommends approval of this Final Plat.

Chair Hathaway asked for citizen comments. There were none.

The Applicant was not present.

Alderman Petersen stated that there was a shared parking agreement between parcels.

Ms. Diaz-Barriga concurred.

Alderman Petersen said this was a concern to tell how this would work. Ms. Diaz-Barriga said there was a site plan proposed that lays out how the parking will be assigned. This was recording the easements to allow the shared driveways.

Chair Hathaway asked for a motion. Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Lindsey. The motion carried unanimously (7-0).

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Lindsey that Item 9 be approved. The vote was carried by the following vote:

- Aye: 7 Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Chairperson Hathaway, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
- Absent: 2 Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen

 Avondale Cottages PUD Subdivision, Site Plan, 40 Residential Units And 5 Open Space Lots On 5.31 Acres, with 1 Design Modification (Street Facing Garages), Located South Of Avondale Drive And East Of Columbia Avenue.

 Attachments:
 6303 Avondale Cottages PUD Subd, SP, Map

 6303 Avondale SP Conditions of Approval_01

 Avondale Site Plan Resubmittal Architecture

 Avondale Site Plan Resubmittal Site Plan Only

 IMG_3577

 IMG_3578

 IMG_3579

 IMG_3580

Chair Hathaway recused himself from Item 10 and passed the Chair to Vice-Chair Lindsey.

Mr. Brad Baumgartner stated this Site plan is for 40 residential units (1 single-family unit, 14 two-family/duplex units, and 25 townhomes) on a 5.31 acre site. The site plan is consistent with the Development Plan that was approved by BOMA on October 11, 2016. The applicant is requesting one design modification regarding garage orientation on some of the duplex units.

Mr. Baumgartner stated the applicant is requesting one design modification to allow attached residential units to have street facing garages and carports. The applicant is requesting a modification of Section 5.3.5 (g) (i) of the Zoning Ordinance, which states, "Garages and car ports serving attached residential structures shall be located to the side or rear of such buildings and shall be oriented perpendicular to the primary streets located around the perimeter of the development." The applicant is proposing street-facing garages for 7 duplex units and street-facing carports for 4 duplex units. The garages are proposed to be for one car only and to be recessed 26 feet from the front façade of the home (36 feet from the R.O.W.). The carports are proposed to cover one car, as well, and to be recessed 10 feet from the front façade of the home (20 feet from the R.O.W.).

Mr. Baumgartner stated Staff finds that the request is not detrimental to public health, safety, or welfare (#1). Staff also finds that, while there are no unique conditions that directly dictate the request for a design modification, the context of the adjacent neighborhood show a mixture of street-facing garages, carports, detached garages, and no garages along the street, making the request consistent with the established pattern of garage placement and not generally applicable to other property (#2). This design modification request varies from the provisions of the recently adopted Envision Franklin and its policies on garage location for attached residential units. However, this PUD Development Plan was approved under the previous Land Use Plan, where there were policies regarding infill sites and development that stated, "New infill development shall be designed in a way that is sensitive to existing uses." Since a mix of street-facing garages and carports are currently existing in the area, staff finds this modification request to be justified. Furthermore, the proposed garages and carports will be recessed significantly from the front façade of the homes and street to minimize their impact on the design and character of the proposed neighborhood, which is consistent with the intent of Envision Franklin and the previous Land Use Plan (#4).

Staff recommends approval with conditions for the Site Plan and approval of the Design Modification.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for citizen comments.

Alderman Mike Skinner commented that he agreed with Staff. He also stated that the Modification of Standards is consistent with is what is existing in the neighborhood. He also stated that this unit was self-contained within its own neighborhood. He requested approval for this Modification of Standards.

Adam Crunk, Crunk Engineering, was there to represent the Applicant, Bristol Development. Mr. Crunk stated he was available to answer questions.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner McLemore that the main motion for Item 10 be approved with Staff conditions.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for discussion.

Commissioner Orr asked for what the carport would look like and if it would be attached to the structure.

Mr. Baumgartner confirmed that it would be attached to the structure.

Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated that there was livable floor space above the carport and that it was more like a niche that the car would go in.

Alderman Petersen agreed that she liked this design better.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked for a motion on the Modification of Standards.

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner McLemore that the Modification of Standards be approved.

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked if there was any discussion.

Alderman Petersen asked when were carports allowed. Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated maybe on single family homes, but it was not typical. Ms. Hunter stated that the Zoning Ordinance allowed for carports.

Commissioner McLemore asked why a Modification of Standards was needed. Ms. Diaz-Barriga stated that carports were currently not allowed on attached homes such as duplexes. She stated that they are allowed but not as street facing.

The motion for the approval of the Modification of Standards was approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with one abstention.

Commissioner Franks asked if the neighborhood Covenants and Restrictions (CCRC's) would prevent people from working on their cars. The Applicant stated that these issues concerning the use of the carports are addressed in the neighborhood CCRC's.

The main motion, as amended, was approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with one abstention.

		Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner McLemore, that the site plan for Item 10 be approved with conditions, including one Design Modification (DM1: 6-0). The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye:	 6 - Commissioner McLemore, Commissioner Petersen, Commissioner Lindsey, Commissioner Franks, Commissioner Orr, and Commissioner Harrison
	Absent:	2 - Commissioner Gregory, and Commissioner Allen
	Recused:	1 - Chairperson Hathaway
	Chairing:	0
11.		Avondale Cottages PUD Subdivision, Final Plat, 40 Residential Lots And 5 Open Space Lots On 5.31 Acres, Located South Of Avondale Drive And East Of Columbia Avenue. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	<u>Attachments:</u>	6302 Avondale Cottages PUD Subd, FP, Map
		6302 Avondale Cottages FP Conditions of Approval 01
		15-095 SPT Avondale Cottages - Final Plat signed 3-2-17
		This Planning Item was approved.
12.		Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision, Final Plat, Revision 2, Creation Of Four Buildable Mixed Use Lots And One Non-Buildable Lot, Associated With The Harpeth Square PUD Subdivision, In A Block Surrounded By East Main Street, 2nd Avenue North, And Bridge Street. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	<u>Attachments:</u>	MAP_HarpethSquareFPpdf.pdf
		6355 harpeth square FP rev 2 Conditions of Approval_01
		Harpeth Square Final Plat - Rev 2 - 3-1-17.pdf
		This Planning Item was approved.
13.		Highlands At Ladd Park PUD Subdivision, Final Plat, Section 34, 29 Detached Residential And 5 Open Space Lots, Located On 18.59 Acres North Of Long Lane And East Of Carothers Parkway. (CONSENT AGENDA)
	<u>Attachments:</u>	6362 Highlands at Ladd Park Sec 34 PUD Subd, FP, Map
		6362 Ladd Park Sec 34 Conditions of Approval_01
		2016029 plat-RESUBMITED 3-2-17-COF 6362
		This Planning Item was approved.

14.	Ironhorse PUD Subdivision, Final Plat, (Aspen Grove Subdivision, Section
14.	
	V, Revision 1), Platting Easements For An Attached Residential
	Development, On 19.99 Acres, Located At The Northeast Corner Of Mack
	Hatcher Parkway And Franklin Road, Located At 145 Legends Club Lane.
	(CONSENT AGENDA)

Attachments: MAP.pdf

6344 Ironhorse FP Conditions of Approval_01 Ironhorse 2017-03-02 Final Plat.pdf

This Planning Item was approved.

NON-AGENDA ITEMS

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked if there were any other items to discuss. There were none.

ANY OTHER BUSINESS

Vice-Chair Lindsey asked if there was any further business. There was none.

ADJOURN

Commissioner Harrison moved, seconded by Commissioner Orr to adjourn the meeting. The motion carried unanimously.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:23 p.m.

Chair, Mike Hathaway