

**FRANKLIN HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION  
MINUTES  
March 12, 2018**

The Franklin Historic Zoning Commission held a special meeting on Monday, March 12, 2018, at 5:00 pm in the City Hall Boardroom at 109 Third Avenue South.

Members Present: Susan Besser  
Kelly Baker-Hefley  
Jeff Carson  
Mike Hathaway  
Jim Roberts  
Mary Pearce  
Ken Scalf

Staff Present: Amanda Rose, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Joey Bryan, Planning & Sustainability Department  
Tiffani Pope, Law Department

**Item 1:  
Call to Order**

Chairwoman Besser called the March 12, 2018 meeting to order at 5 pm.

**Item 2:  
Minutes: December 11, 2017**

Ms. Pearce moved to approve the February 12, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Ms. Baker-Hefley seconded the motion, and the motion carried 7-0.

**Item 3:  
Minutes February 12, 2018**

Mr. Hathaway moved to approve the February 12, 2018 meeting minutes as submitted. Ms. Baker-Hefley seconded the motion, and the motion carried 7-0.

**Item 4:  
Staff Announcements.**

Ms. Rose stated she wanted to give a brief update on the Downtown National Register list and stated they did find one additional property at the corner of 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue South and South Margin Street. Ms. Rose stated it is moving forward to the State and she would bring back more information when she gets it. Ms. Rose stated the Design Review Committee is next Monday and there maybe 11 to 12 items.

**Item 5:  
Consideration of Requests to place non-agenda emergency items on the agenda.**

No non-agenda emergency items.

**Item 6:**

**Citizens Comments on Items Not on the Agenda**

**Open for Franklin citizens to be heard on items not included on this Agenda. As provided by law, the Historic Zoning Commission shall make no decisions or consideration of action of citizen comments, except to refer the matter to the Planning Director for administrative consideration, or to schedule the matter for Historic Zoning Commission consideration at a later date.**

No one requested to speak.

**Item 7:**

**Consideration of New Construction (Architectural Features & Materials) at 99 E. Main St.; Will Schaedle, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the architectural features and materials associated with the new construction of a two-story mixed-use development with rooftop deck feature at 99 E. Main St. Ms. Rose stated the footprint, massing, scale, and height were approved by the Historic Zoning Commission at its February 12, 2018 meeting, with the condition that the architectural design elements and materials return to the HZC for consideration and approval prior to final City Site Plan approval. Ms. Rose stated Architectural detailing and materials include, but are not limited to, the following:

- Masonry and storefront materials and configurations;
- Front elevation vertical divisions;
- Cornices and parapets;
- Entrances and their respective configurations;
- Windows;
- Rooftop deck and parking screening; and
- Utilities screening.

Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its February 19, 2018, meeting. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed architectural features and materials of the new construction with the following conditions:

1. All brick materials be “compatible in size, profile, and detailing with historic materials.” The applicant must provide compatible brick samples for consideration and approval by the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. Parking screening should be provided through the use of landscape elements or brick walls (both of which are common to the historic district) so as to retain the general setback pattern.
3. Any utilities proposed for placement on the top of the building must be placed such that distance or elements like parapets keep them from view, per the *Guidelines*. Grounded utilities must also be screened from street view, per the *Guidelines*.
4. The application must meet the requirements of the City for site plan approval and building permitting.
5. Any exterior alterations to the plan set, including, but not limited to, foundation height, overall building height, materials, architectural features, and building footprint, must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for consideration and approval in light of the *Guidelines*.
6. All signage, awnings, building-mounted lighting, and individual storefront configurations require additional information and more detailed specifications be submitted to the Preservation Planner for determination of eligibility for COAs. This information must be submitted in the form of COA applications at later dates.

Mr. Reese stated they have spent a lot of time to address a number of concerns mentioned at DRC. Mr. Reese passed out a rendering of more detail on the brick. Mr. Reese stated the entrances must be moved further away from the corner. Mr. Reese stated they changed the brick pattern and brought samples to view. Mr. Reese state they adjusted cornices and parapets all the around the building. Mr. Reese stated he was glad to answer any questions.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if anyone from the audience wished to speak, and no one did.

Mr. Scalf moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6625 for the new construction's proposed architectural features and materials with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated March 12, 2018. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion.

Mr. Roberts wanted the height above the roof deck clarified.

Mr. Reese stated 42 inches.

Mr. Roberts requested the height from the rail to the parapet.

Mr. Reese stated about a foot.

Ms. Pearce stated she is concerned about the number of arched windows and moved that the applicant come back to staff with another more squared styled window that go along Main Street—except for the 4 in the parapet area—and bring details back to staff for approval and rear elevation match front windows.

Ms. Rose requested to know if that meant the entire front façade.

Ms. Pearce stated only the top ones along Main Street past the parapet to the river.

Ms. Rose projected a sketch to make sure she had the amendment correct.

Ms. Pearce stated the detailing on the arched section should be brought back to staff for approval.

Ms. Rose clarified the motion and locations of the windows.

With no second, the amendment motion failed.

The main motion passed 7-0.

Chairwoman Besser stated they did not look at the brick.

Ms. Rose stated she did not have the brick in her possession at time of review.

Mr. Schneider walked around showing the brick to the commissioners.

Ms. Rose stated she would review the brick administratively.

#### **Item 8:**

**Consideration of Alterations (Entrance) at 334 Main St.; Marianne DeMeyers, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of the entrance doors at 334 Main St. Ms. Rose stated applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its February 19, 2018 meeting.

Ms. Rose stated it recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the proposed entrance door replacement request with the following:

1. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department.
2. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Ms. DeMeyers stated she understands maybe two to three different ways ADA is compatible with a small and large door and it may have to switch back over to the smaller fixed glass door and then the larger opening from the center and would like confirmation on her understanding of this.

Ms. Rose stated she could go on site with Mr. Bornick from BNS to help with this configuration.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if anyone from the audience wished to speak, and no one did.

Mr. Roberts moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6643 for the replacement of the entrance door with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated March 12, 2018. Mr. Carson seconded the motion and the motion passed 7-0.

#### **Item 9:**

#### **Consideration of Signage at 117 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. N.; Aubree Parker, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the alteration of existing post-and-panel signage at 117 3<sup>rd</sup> Ave. N. Ms. Rose stated the alteration involves the replacement of an existing slat that is installed underneath the main panel with a larger slat. The larger slat is proposed to accommodate additional tenant signage. Ms. Rose stated the main panel measures approximately 12 sq. ft., and the existing slat measures approximately 2.5 sq. ft. Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee to discuss the proposal at its November 20, 2017 and February 19, 2018 meetings. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission deny the proposed signage with the following:

1. The *Guidelines* recommend that post-and-panel signs measure no more than 12 square feet for the total sign face. The existing slat measures approximately 8" x 45.75", or 2.5 sq. ft. The proposed slat measures 10" x 45.75", or 3.16 sq. ft. Since the existing sign already exceeds 12 sq. ft. in total sign face, the proposed alteration to the sign is not consistent with the *Guidelines* (p.85, #1).
2. If issued a COA, the application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a sign permit, and any proposed changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Ms. Parker stated it would be to remove the current signage and add signage for current tenants.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if anyone from the audience wished to speak, and no one did.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6647 for the signage in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District*

*Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated March 12, 2018. Mr. Roberts seconded the motion and the motion passed 7-0.

**Item 10:**

**Consideration of Alterations to Previously-Approved New Construction at 115 Harlinsdale Ct.; Kent Eshleman, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for alterations to the previously-approved two-story single-family residence with attached three-bay garage at 115 Harlinsdale Ct. (Lot 13). Ms. Rose stated the Historic Zoning Commission approved the existing plan at its October 9, 2017 meeting. Ms. Rose stated the following alterations are proposed to the existing plan:

- The addition of a reverse gable to the front of the main roof;
- The use of a stone foundation in lieu of a painted brick foundation;
- The use of a 4' cementitious lap siding in lieu of painted brick;
- The use of five windows on the front façade of the main form in lieu of the approved nine windows on the front façade of the main form; and
- The use of a hipped roof instead of a shed roof on the front porch.

Ms. Rose stated the no alterations are proposed to the building footprint, to the side or rear elevations, the plot plan, or the height of the main roofline, as previously approved. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions the proposed alterations to the previously-approved new construction with the following:

1. The applicant must submit a full set of elevations to the Preservation Planner, indicating the overall height of the construction and all previous conditions of approval, for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
2. All windows must have historic profile and dimension and consist of either wood or a composite material with the appearance of wood. The window specifications must be approved by the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission prior to issuance of a building permit.
3. The type of metal proposed for use on the roof has not been specified. Standing seam metal is recommended. The applicant must submit the specifications to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
4. The applicant must submit a sample of the stone proposed for use on the chimneys to the Preservation Planner for review and approval prior to issuance of a building permit.
5. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department prior to issuance of a building permit. Any proposed changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Sipple stated he brought a stone sample with him and showed the sample to the commission.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if anyone from the audience wished to speak, and no one did.

Ms. Baker-Hefley moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6644 for the proposed alterations to the previously-approved new construction in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated March 12, 2018. Mr. Scalf seconded the motion and the motion passed 7-0.

**Item 11:**

**Consideration of Alterations (Window Replacement) at 416 & 418 Main St.; Paul Barrett, Applicant.**

Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of the four (4) front elevation upper-story windows at 416 & 418 Main St. Ms. Rose stated the applicant appeared before the Design Review Committee (DRC) to discuss the proposal at its July 17, 2017 and November 20, 2017 meetings. Ms. Rose stated the applicant is requesting to replace the non-historic windows on the upper level of the two storefronts of the building (totaling four windows). Ms. Rose stated the existing windows exhibit some areas of rot. Ms. Rose stated the *Guidelines* recommend the preservation and maintenance of original windows, opening dimensions, and details (p.129, #1). Ms. Rose stated the *Guidelines* also recommend that replacement windows (if originals are missing) match the historic materials found on the building (p.129, #5) and be appropriate to the period of the building, and as such, a late 19<sup>th</sup> or early 20<sup>th</sup> century building is recommended to utilize four-over-four, two-over-two, or one-over-one sashes with distinct meeting rails and an operable appearance (p.129, #7). Ms. Rose stated per the *Guidelines*, wood, anodized aluminum with dark bronze finishes, or white baked-enamel aluminum may be appropriate for replacement windows (p.129, #9). Ms. Rose stated as non-original, non-historic windows, replacement of the existing windows is entirely appropriate. Ms. Rose stated the applicant is proposing replacement in-kind, with wood as the material, a one-over-one double hung profile, and the same glazing-to-wood ratio. As such, the proposed replacement windows are appropriate to the early 20<sup>th</sup> century age of the building and historic materials of the building, and the proposal is consistent with the recommendations of the Design Review Committee. Ms. Rose stated it is recommended that the Historic Zoning Commission approve the proposed window replacement request with the following:

1. The application must meet all the requirements of the Building & Neighborhood Services Department.
2. Any changes to the approved plans must be returned to the Preservation Planner or the Historic Zoning Commission for review and approval.

Mr. Barrett stated he had no comments to add.

Chairwoman Besser requested to know if anyone from the audience wished to speak, and no one did.

Ms. Pearce moved that the Franklin Historic Zoning Commission approve with conditions a Certificate of Appropriateness for Project PL #6645 for the replacement of the front elevation upper-story windows with staff's comments, in accordance with the *Franklin Historic District Design Guidelines* and based on the Staff Report & Recommendation dated March 12, 2018. Mr. Hathaway seconded the motion and the motion passed 7-0.

**Item 12:**

**Consideration of Historic Preservation Buffer Reduction Request for Proposed Cheekwood Golf Club Expansion PUD Subdivision, located at 285 Spencer Creek Rd. (Parcel 063-02101); Greg Gamble, Applicant.**

This item was deferred by the applicant.

**Item 13:**

**Non-agenda emergency items accepted by the commission for consideration.**

No non-agenda items.

**Item 14:**

**Adjourn.**

With no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:55 p.m.

---

**Acting Secretary**

DRAFT