

**City of Franklin, Tennessee**  
**Tabulation of Submittals**\*

<b>Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:</b>		<b>2018-016 (third-party administrator services for workers compensation self-insurance program)</b>																																																																																																				
<b>Notice to proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:</b>		3/29/18																																																																																																				
<b>Number of potential proposers that were notified of / that submitted a proposal in response to this request for proposals:</b>		7 / 4																																																																																																				
<b>Date and time proposal due and publicly opened:</b>		4/26/18 2:00 PM																																																																																																				
<b>Present at opening of proposals:</b>		Sara E. Sylvis and Chris Edwards of the City of Franklin HR Department; and Natalie Keene, Suzanne Ward and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office																																																																																																				
<b>Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation is scheduled to be considered:</b>		6/12/18																																																																																																				
<table border="1" style="width:100%; border-collapse: collapse;"> <thead> <tr> <th rowspan="2" style="width:25%;">Proposals received from:</th> <th rowspan="2" style="width:5%;">Does the proposal include all required documents?</th> <th rowspan="2" style="width:5%;">Does the proposal take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation?</th> <th colspan="4" style="width:25%;">life-of-claim claims management</th> <th colspan="4" style="width:25%;">life-of-contract claims management</th> <th rowspan="2" style="width:5%;">Payment terms:</th> <th rowspan="2" style="width:5%;">Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:</th> </tr> <tr> <th style="width:5%;">Pricing options offered:</th> <th style="width:10%;">Total estimated fee for required services (claims &amp; litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes, for two-year term of award:</th> <th style="width:10%;">Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):</th> <th style="width:10%;">Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):</th> <th style="width:5%;">Pricing options offered:</th> <th style="width:10%;">Total estimated fee for required services (claims &amp; litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes for two-year term of award:</th> <th style="width:10%;">Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):</th> <th style="width:10%;">Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Action Claims Administrators 1201 Military Road #223 Benton, Arkansas 72105 Chad Alexander, Vice President 855/284-5931 ext. 708 calexander@actionclaimsadministrators.com</td> <td align="center">Yes</td> <td align="center">No</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td></td> <td align="center">flat fee</td> <td align="right">\$201,628.00</td> <td align="right">32.04</td> <td align="center">not interviewed</td> <td align="center">net 30 days</td> <td align="center">7/15/2018</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cannon Cochran Management Services, Inc. (CCMSI) Two International Plaza Dr., Suite 301 Nashville, TN 37217 Wendy Lanphere, National Sales Executive 615/361-0069 wlanphere@ccmsi.com</td> <td align="center">Yes</td> <td align="center">No</td> <td align="center">per claim</td> <td align="right">\$146,012.00</td> <td align="right">94.01</td> <td align="right">64.01</td> <td></td> <td align="center">per claim</td> <td align="right">\$141,500.00</td> <td align="right">87.15</td> <td align="right">57.15</td> <td align="center">net 30 days</td> <td align="center">6/30/2018</td> </tr> <tr style="background-color: yellow;"> <td>PMA Management Corp. 535 Marriott Drive, Suite 230 Nashville, TN 37214 Brad Wilson, Account Executive 804/967-5699 (O); 804/928-6580 (M) brad_wilson@pmagroup.com</td> <td align="center">Yes</td> <td align="center">Yes</td> <td align="center">flat fee</td> <td align="right">\$164,106.00</td> <td align="right">96.37</td> <td align="right">93.03</td> <td></td> <td align="center">flat fee</td> <td align="right">\$151,156.00</td> <td align="right">91.05</td> <td align="right">87.72</td> <td align="center">net 30 days</td> <td align="center">7/24/2018</td> </tr> <tr style="background-color: yellow;"> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td align="center">per claim</td> <td align="right">\$140,256.00</td> <td align="right">100.00</td> <td align="right">96.67</td> <td></td> <td align="center">per claim</td> <td align="right">\$132,376.00</td> <td align="right">93.33</td> <td align="right">90.00</td> <td></td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>Underwriters Safety &amp; Claims 1700 Eastpoint Parkway Louisville, KY 40223 Terry Banaszak, VP - TPA Services 502-489-6224 terryb@uscky.com</td> <td align="center">Yes</td> <td align="center">No</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td align="center">not quoted</td> <td></td> <td align="center">flat fee</td> <td align="right">\$97,066.00</td> <td align="right">60.00</td> <td align="center">not interviewed</td> <td align="center">net 30 days</td> <td align="center">12/31/2018</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>												Proposals received from:	Does the proposal include all required documents?	Does the proposal take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation?	life-of-claim claims management				life-of-contract claims management				Payment terms:	Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:	Pricing options offered:	Total estimated fee for required services (claims & litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes, for two-year term of award:	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Pricing options offered:	Total estimated fee for required services (claims & litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes for two-year term of award:	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Action Claims Administrators 1201 Military Road #223 Benton, Arkansas 72105 Chad Alexander, Vice President 855/284-5931 ext. 708 calexander@actionclaimsadministrators.com	Yes	No	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted		flat fee	\$201,628.00	32.04	not interviewed	net 30 days	7/15/2018	Cannon Cochran Management Services, Inc. (CCMSI) Two International Plaza Dr., Suite 301 Nashville, TN 37217 Wendy Lanphere, National Sales Executive 615/361-0069 wlanphere@ccmsi.com	Yes	No	per claim	\$146,012.00	94.01	64.01		per claim	\$141,500.00	87.15	57.15	net 30 days	6/30/2018	PMA Management Corp. 535 Marriott Drive, Suite 230 Nashville, TN 37214 Brad Wilson, Account Executive 804/967-5699 (O); 804/928-6580 (M) brad_wilson@pmagroup.com	Yes	Yes	flat fee	\$164,106.00	96.37	93.03		flat fee	\$151,156.00	91.05	87.72	net 30 days	7/24/2018				per claim	\$140,256.00	100.00	96.67		per claim	\$132,376.00	93.33	90.00			Underwriters Safety & Claims 1700 Eastpoint Parkway Louisville, KY 40223 Terry Banaszak, VP - TPA Services 502-489-6224 terryb@uscky.com	Yes	No	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted		flat fee	\$97,066.00	60.00	not interviewed	net 30 days	12/31/2018
Proposals received from:	Does the proposal include all required documents?	Does the proposal take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation?	life-of-claim claims management				life-of-contract claims management				Payment terms:				Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:																																																																																							
			Pricing options offered:	Total estimated fee for required services (claims & litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes, for two-year term of award:	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Pricing options offered:	Total estimated fee for required services (claims & litigation mgmt, loss control and managed care), using estimated volumes for two-year term of award:	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):																																																																																												
Action Claims Administrators 1201 Military Road #223 Benton, Arkansas 72105 Chad Alexander, Vice President 855/284-5931 ext. 708 calexander@actionclaimsadministrators.com	Yes	No	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted		flat fee	\$201,628.00	32.04	not interviewed	net 30 days	7/15/2018																																																																																									
Cannon Cochran Management Services, Inc. (CCMSI) Two International Plaza Dr., Suite 301 Nashville, TN 37217 Wendy Lanphere, National Sales Executive 615/361-0069 wlanphere@ccmsi.com	Yes	No	per claim	\$146,012.00	94.01	64.01		per claim	\$141,500.00	87.15	57.15	net 30 days	6/30/2018																																																																																									
PMA Management Corp. 535 Marriott Drive, Suite 230 Nashville, TN 37214 Brad Wilson, Account Executive 804/967-5699 (O); 804/928-6580 (M) brad_wilson@pmagroup.com	Yes	Yes	flat fee	\$164,106.00	96.37	93.03		flat fee	\$151,156.00	91.05	87.72	net 30 days	7/24/2018																																																																																									
			per claim	\$140,256.00	100.00	96.67		per claim	\$132,376.00	93.33	90.00																																																																																											
Underwriters Safety & Claims 1700 Eastpoint Parkway Louisville, KY 40223 Terry Banaszak, VP - TPA Services 502-489-6224 terryb@uscky.com	Yes	No	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted	not quoted		flat fee	\$97,066.00	60.00	not interviewed	net 30 days	12/31/2018																																																																																									

\*Shaded submittal is the submittal scored highest by the interview team