

**MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL WORK SESSION
BOARD OF MAYOR AND ALDERMEN
FRANKLIN, TENNESSEE
CITY HALL BOARDROOM
WEDNESDAY, AUGUST 30, 2017 –6:00 P.M.**

Board Members

Mayor Ken Moore	P		
Vice Mayor Pearl Bransford	A	Alderman Dana McLendon	P
Alderman Clyde Barnhill	P	Alderman Margaret Martin	P
Alderman Brandy Blanton	P	Alderman Ann Petersen	P
Alderman Beverly Burger	P	Alderman Michael Skinner	P

Department Directors/Staff

Eric Stuckey, City Administrator	P	Lanaii Benne, Assistant City Recorder	P
Vernon Gerth, ACA Community & Economic Dev.	P	Linda Fulwider, Board Recording Secretary	P
Mark Hilty, ACA Public Works	P		
Paul Holzen, Engineering Director	P		
Jonathan Marston, Assistant Director Engineering	P		

Call to Order

Dr. Ken Moore, Mayor, called the Special Work Session to order at 6:00 p.m. following the 4:30 p.m. Open House.

SPECIAL WORK SESSION DISCUSSION ITEM

1. 17-0765 Continued Discussion Regarding Columbia Avenue Improvements Project Design Alternatives and Consideration of Resolution 2017-43 to Select the Corridor Design Concept for the Columbia Avenue Widening & Improvements Project.

Paul Holzen, Engineering Director

Jonathan Marston, Assistant Director Engineering

Paul Holzen noted there are two options for the short-term/long-term traffic problems in this corridor: 1) Five-Lane Concept with Access Management 2) Roundabout Concept with Access Management. The Traditional Five-Lane Concept was shown for comparison, but is not considered to be the best option overall. Concepts 1 and 2 would deliver high quality roadway on Columbia Avenue. The open house is the fourth public meeting held to give business owners the chance to look at the options. The presentation is back to curb to back to curb. Future discussions will be on public utilities, poles, underground lines, pedestrian travel, trails and sidewalks. Public Transit is an issue. Staff will meet with TMA on what to do long-term. Safety and physical impact are of primary concern. There are pros and cons with both options, but both are acceptable for the long-term.

Jonathan Marston presented the following:

- Regional Context: Map shows Columbia Avenue is a primary U.S and State route south in Middle Tennessee.
- Project Location: Columbia Avenue from Mack Hatcher to Downs Boulevard = 1 mile.
- May 2016 = 18,900 vehicles per day.
- Daily Traffic = 7% AM, Mid-day, PM, Off-Peak 79%
- Traffic Composition = 7% Trucks, 93% Cars
- 11% Peak Trucks
- Traffic Type = Through Traffic 45%, Local Trips 55%
- The numbers assume Mack Hatcher is a full loop built around the City

- April 2016 Travel Time from Battle Avenue to Winstead Elementary: 3:10 minutes with no traffic; 5:10 minutes average day; 10:20 minutes longest recorded.
- Future Growth: 2021 Build Year forecast conditions at project completion = 19,000 vehicles/day; 2041 Design Year improvements are designed to accommodate 20 years of growth = 25,400 vehicles/day.
- 3 Components of Comparison: Operations, Safety, Physical Impact.
- Operations (Anticipated Travel Time and Average Speed, 2041 Volumes – Columbia Avenue)
 - ~ No-Build Conditions 5:50 @ 14.5 mph
 - ~ Traditional Five-Lane Concept 4:30 @ 18.5 mph
 - ~ Five-Lane Concept (Access Management) 4:40 @ 18.1 mph
 - ~ Roundabout Concept 4:30 @ 18.5 mph
 - ~ Covers one week of simulated rush hours (20 hours total)
 - ~ Results are average travel time of all 35,000+ simulated vehicles between Fairground Street and Winstead Hill Park.

	Columbia Ave	Side Street	Seconds
Existing Conditions (2016 volumes)	90 seconds	110 seconds	200 seconds
No-Build (2041 volumes)	210 seconds	775 seconds	985 seconds
Traditional Five-Lane Concept (2041 volumes)	135 seconds	230 seconds	365 seconds
Five-Lane Concept Access Management (2041 volumes)	145 seconds	230 seconds	375 seconds
Roundabout Concept (2041 volumes)	130 seconds	110 seconds	240 seconds

- Operations (Delay, Level of Service (LOS), and Queue Length)

Signalized Intersections

Level of Service	Average Control Delay (seconds/vehicle)	General Description
A	≤10	Free Flow
B	>10 – 20	Stable Flow (slight delays)
C	>20 – 35	Stable Flow (acceptable delays)
D	>35 – 55	Approaching Unstable Flow (tolerable delay-occasionally wait through more than 1 cycle)
E	>55 – 80	Unstable Flow (intolerable delay)
F	>80	Forced Flow (congested and queues fail to clear)

Unsignalized Intersections (i.e. All-Way Stop, Two-Stop, Roundabout)

Level of Service	Average Control Delay (seconds/vehicle)	General Description
A	≤10	Free Flow
B	>10 – 15	Stable Flow (slight delays)
C	>15 – 25	Stable Flow (acceptable delays)
D	>25 – 35	Approaching Unstable Flow (tolerable delay-occasionally wait through more than 1 cycle)
E	>35 – 50	Unstable Flow (intolerable delay)
F	>50	Forced Flow (congested and queues fail to clear)

NOTE: Two-way stop controlled intersections are defined in terms of individual movements.

- Safety (Collision Date (2013-2016) – MVM = Million Vehicle-Miles)

All Collisions		Fatal/Injury Collisions	
Columbia Avenue Actual Crash History	Statewide Averages	Columbia Avenue Actual Crash History	Statewide Averages
7.72 collisions/MVM	2.76 collisions/MVM	1.23 collisions/MVM	0.68 collisions/MVM

- Safety – Columbia Avenue Conflict Points

No-Build Conditions	Five-Lane Concepts		Roundabout Concept
	(Traditional)	(Access Management)	
504	583	385	258
Vehicle Conflict Points	Vehicle Conflict Points	Vehicle Conflict Points	Vehicle Conflict Points

- Safety – 2041 Anticipated Change in Traffic Collisions Between Intersections
 - ~ No-Build Condition (2041) +49% over 2016 conditions
 - ~ Traditional Five-Lane Concept +41%
 - ~ Five-Lane Access Management Concept +26%
 - ~ Roundabout Concept -10%

At Intersections

- ~ No-Build Condition (2041) +43% over 2016 conditions
- ~ Traditional Five-Lane Concept +2%
- ~ Five-Lane Access Management Concept +1%
- ~ Roundabout Concept -26%
- Physical Impact (Typical Sections)
 - ~ Five Lane Concepts 91' wide (back of walk to back of walk)
 - ~ Roundabout Concept 83' wide (back of walk to back of walk)
- Data Summary

Operational Performance		No-Build Conditions (2041 volumes)	5-Lane Concept (Traditional)	5-Lane Concept (Access Management)	Roundabout Concept
	Through Traffic Delay	210 (sec/veh)	135 (sec/veh)	145 (sec/veh)	130 (sec/veh)
	Side Street Delay	775 (sec/veh)	230 (sec/veh)	230 (sec/veh)	110 (sec/veh)
Safety Performance	Average Travel Time	5:50	4:30	4:40	4:30
	Between Intersections	BASELINE ((+49% from 2016)	+41% (from BASELINE)	+26% (from BASELINE)	-10% (from BASELINE)
	At Intersections	BASELINE (+43% from 2016)	+2% (from BASELINE)	+1% (from BASELINE)	-26% (from BASELINE)
Physical Impact	Between Intersections	~70' (ditch to ditch)	91' (total width)	91' (total width)	83' (total width)
	At Intersections	BASELINE Impact	AVERAGE footprint	AVERAGE footprint	INCREASED footprint

Paul Holzen presented a “drive-through” the concepts:

Five-Lane Concept with Access Management -

- Mack Hatcher and Columbia Avenue: Build to full capacity. Southbound turn lane hatching is for Mack Hatcher when it is built. Sidewalk and trail shown. Six inch raised concrete median separating north and south lanes.
- Right in and right out at Williamson Memorial. Left turn access. Additional lanes north.
- Right in and right out at Kroger fuel with median in center.
- Signal at Shadow Green Drive and Southeast Parkway
- Burger King is right in as it is now. Remove median and add center turn lane.
- Car Bazaar and Corner Pub share an access point at Alpha Drive. The five-lane concept with a walking trail cuts into the Car Bazaar parking lot. Engineering will look at alignment.
- At Guidance Center shift access to Alpha Drive.
- One private resident access shift to Century Court.
- Mane Event eliminate access and provide access at Century Court.
- Auto Masters shared access on Beasley Drive.
- Solar Solutions right in on Columbia and shared access with Auto Masters. Provide right in to provide enough room for large fuel trucks.
- Access to Public Works Facility on Beasley Drive.
- Rolling Hills Church, two accesses making access to the north right in and right out and one full access.
- Franklin Business Park right in and right out,
- Longview development access to Lasko. Signalize with median.
- Fritz’s European Auto Repair, shift access to Confederate Drive.
- Hardee’s access to Confederate Drive taking Columbia access away. Signalize long-term.
- Eliminate some of the access points at Moody’s and shift to the TMA Group (County) property and make TMA access right in right out.
- Kubota access on Carr Avenue and to signal at Downs Boulevard.
- True Value on west side, one shared access right in and right out. Primary access to Downs Boulevard.
- NAPA relocation of access from Columbia to public drive access to Avondale Avenue.
- Tim’s Deli shared access.

- Former Lankford Motors change access to Downs Boulevard

There were some questions regarding utilities which will cause additional impact. It is too early in the process to have that discussion. The Board will address the issue later.

Roundabout Concept –

- Concept the same as the five-lane initially just north of Mack Hatcher. Full median would be on Columbia to separate north and south lanes. Right in right out at Williamson Funeral Home. The roundabouts have a bigger impact at intersections but the roadway in between is narrower which lessens the impact on properties in between. When roundabouts are designed properly they can accommodate the large trucks just as well as the five-lane concept.
- Raised center line median between all the roundabouts. Kroger fuel right in right out with more accesses than the five-lane concept. Main access on Columbia Avenue. The Board has a condition saying that access will be eliminated; however, the issue will be brought back to the Board to request the right in/right out remain.
- Alpha Drive right in/right out. Full median works at intersection. The roundabout would probably eliminate the guitar center.
- Crutcher's would retain access on Columbia Avenue.
- Auto Masters would share access to Beasley Drive.
- Public Works Facility would be right in/right out.
- Rolling Hills both accesses right in/right out.
- Business Park and Lasko right in/right out.
- Median all the way to the next roundabout.
- Shift access points, Hardee's to Confederate Drive.
- Taco Bell access to Werthan Circle.
- Moody's and TMA share access points.
- True Value right in/right out access to Downs Boulevard.

Discussion:

- Alderman McLendon said he wasn't suggesting a preference, but noted that the presentation shows the roundabout concept narrows the road in between roundabouts for safety, but also eliminates two businesses. The five-lane has greater impact on parking and accesses and carries less traffic. There is not a huge difference in improvement based on the modeling. Improvement shown with the roundabout north and south and a median down the middle.
- Alderman Petersen: There is limited access several places with a median down the middle.
- Paul Holzen: Medians help with safety and access.

Citizen Comments:

- Michael, Phillips, 417 Gambrel Court, Franklin: Read an excerpt from the Zoning Ordinance pertaining to levels of service on roads that **shall** be maintained. Staff saying that both concepts are acceptable disagrees with the Zoning Ordinance. Is the Zoning Ordinance being followed or ignored?
- Jamie Crutcher, 1906 Columbia Avenue, Franklin, owner of auto repair shop: The presentations felt like sales pitches for roundabouts. Believes the data is unreliable, there are many assumptions, and the numbers are incorrect and skewed. The City should hold off on making improvements on Columbia Avenue until Mack Hatcher Northwest is built. Mr. Crutcher had many questions, some of which were answered by Jonathan Marston. Due to time limits for each speaker, he was asked to submit his questions to Engineering for Mr. Marston to answer.
- Donnie Cameron, 1503 Columbia Avenue, Franklin: Referred to the Columbia Avenue corridor as being Old Franklin with businesses established many years ago. Many are trying to preserve Old Franklin. If Columbia Avenue corridor is changed from what it is some businesses won't survive the change. Is the no-build still on the table?

- Paul Hoppe, 1814 Columbia Avenue, Franklin, owner of the Master Market: Leave the integrity of Columbia Avenue the way it is. It is a choice between losing access to businesses or encroaching on businesses. Keep inside Franklin as Old Franklin. Don't cater to those who want to just travel through to get somewhere else because it will affect the livelihood of the people who own business and live here. It doesn't make sense to put walking trails and bike trails in an industrial part of town.
- Jeff Davis, 101 Century Court, Franklin, owner of a discount plumbing business. Regarding a roundabout, he has concerns about the semis and dump trucks coming and going numerous times during the day.

Discussion:

- Alderman Martin: Addressed Mr. Crutcher's concern of it appearing as though the Board put more emphasis on roundabouts than a 5-lane road. She explained it was more an educational process for the Board and others who had little knowledge on how roundabouts function. She asked to see the video of large trucks maneuvering roundabouts.
- Mr. Holzen said two videos are on the City website. Both videos were then shown. Both videos were shot in Wisconsin, one with vehicle volume at 28,000 per day and the other with volume of about 10,000 vehicles per day. The roundabouts in the videos are not the same design as the roundabouts proposed for Columbia Avenue; however, they did show how big trucks use the truck aprons while maneuvering roundabouts.
- Mayor Moore and Eric Stuckey pointed out that BOMA must choose between the 5-lane concept and roundabout concept as the general road design first to allow the project to move forward. A "no build" option is a choice for the Board as well. The Resolution will go forward to a BOMA voting meeting.
- Alderman Blanton: A balance of work hours should be discussed so the construction has less impact on the businesses in that corridor. She shares the mindset of people who own businesses in this corridor. It is their livelihood being paused or deleted and weighs heavily in decision making. If the money isn't used for the Columbia Avenue project, it cannot be transferred to another City project. The money would go back to the MPO. Also, to wait for Mack Hack Hatcher Northwest to be completed is not feasible.

Other Business

None

Adjournment

Work Session adjourned @ 7:30 p.m.

Dr. Ken Moore, Mayor

Minutes prepared by: Linda Fulwider, Board Recording Secretary, City Administrator's Office - updated 10/24/2017 11:13 AM