

City of Franklin, Tennessee
Tabulation of Submittals*

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2016-018 - group life, accidental death and dismemberment, and supplemental life insurance						
Notice to proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:		2/18/16						
Number of potential proposers that were notified of / that submitted a proposal in response to this request for proposals:		19 / 8						
Date and time proposal due and publicly opened:		3/22/16, 2:00 PM						
Present at opening of proposals:		Jake Davis of Cowan Benefits; Sara E. Sylvis and Shirley Harmon Gower of the City of Franklin HR Department; and Dee Settle and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office						
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation is scheduled to be considered:		5/24/16						
Proposals received from:		Does the proposal include all required documents?	Does the proposal take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation?	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Total quoted pricing for Basic Life/Basic AD&D/ Supplemental Life (expressed per \$1,000 of benefit):	Payment terms:	Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:
5Star Life Insurance Company 909 N. Washington St. Alexandria, VA 22314 Sal Campanile, VP, Worksite Voluntary Benefits & Group Sales 202/431-4745 scampanile@afba.com		No (missing references, detailed responses to questionnaire, and Tennessee License)	No	76.50	not interviewed	\$0.120 \$0.025 \$0.120	net 30 days	6/22/2016
Aetna Life Insurance Company 151 Farmington Avenue Hartford, CT 06156 Julie Currin, Senior Account Manager 704/221-5530 CurrinJ@aetna.com		No (CoF Std T's & C's with vendor's contact information inserted not included pending negotiations if selected)	Yes (Proposer requested changes to: RFP 11. h, l, m, q, 12.6; CoF Std T's&C's 1, 6, 9, 11, 12, 17, 18; Procurement Agreement 7, 8, 11; Indemnification Agreement; deviations noted)	97.52	97.09	\$0.140 \$0.025 \$0.140	net 30 days	not indicated
Dearborn National Life Insurance Company 1020 31st Street Downers Grove, IL 60515 Tyler Cummins, Sales Executive 615-438-4967 Tyler_Cummins@dearbornnational.com		Yes	Yes (Proposer requests changes to: RFP 11.h, 11.m and 12.6 Insurance Requirements; CoF Std T's&C's 1, 11, 12, 15; Indemnification Agreement 3; deviations noted)	96.19	not interviewed	\$0.136 \$0.025 \$0.140	net 30 days	10/1/2016
Lincoln Financial Group 6840 Carothers Pkwy., Suite 120 Franklin, TN 37067 Scott C. Warren, Senior Account Executive 615/435-0087 Scott.Warren@lfg.com		Yes	No	98.38	90.25	\$0.110 \$0.025 \$0.140	net 30 days	8/31/2016
The Municipal Pool (of Minnesota) for Minnesota Life Insurance Company 400 Robert Street North St. Paul, MN 55101 Katherine Degelmann, Sales Representative 651/665-3789 kdegelmann@ochsinc.com		Yes	No (Proposer indicated no exceptions were taken but also indicated a listing of exceptions was enclosed. None were found. Proposer T&Cs provided but not yet reviewed for acceptability.)	89.69	not interviewed	\$0.190 \$0.030 \$0.190	net 30 days	6/20/2016

*Shaded submittal is the submittal scored highest by the interview team

City of Franklin, Tennessee
Tabulation of Submittals*

Purchasing Office Solicitation No.:		2016-018 - group life, accidental death and dismemberment, and supplemental life insurance						
Notice to proposers published in the Williamson Herald on:		2/18/16						
Number of potential proposers that were notified of / that submitted a proposal in response to this request for proposals:		19 / 8						
Date and time proposal due and publicly opened:		3/22/16, 2:00 PM						
Present at opening of proposals:		Jake Davis of Cowan Benefits; Sara E. Sylvis and Shirley Harmon Gower of the City of Franklin HR Department; and Dee Settle and Brian Wilcox of the City of Franklin Purchasing Office						
Target meeting of BOMA at which recommendation is scheduled to be considered:		5/24/16						
Proposals received from:		Does the proposal include all required documents?	Does the proposal take any exceptions to the City's procurement solicitation?	Average points allocated by proposal evaluation team (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Average points allocated by interview panel (out of a possible 100, utilizing evaluation criteria as listed in RFP):	Total quoted pricing for Basic Life/Basic AD&D/ Supplemental Life (expressed per \$1,000 of benefit):	Payment terms:	Proposal is valid and may be accepted through:
Symetra Life Insurance Company 1699 King Street Enfield, CT 06082 Donald F. Canfield, AVP, Director of Life & Disability Underwriting 860/746-7701 don.canfield@symetra.com		No (missing detailed responses to the RFP questions, references and Tennessee license)	Yes (Proposer requests changes to: CoF Std T's&C's 11, 21, 15; Indemnification Agreement; deviations noted)	86.44	not interviewed	\$0.130 \$0.025 \$0.130	net 30 days	5/31/2016
The Prudential Insurance Company of America 80 Livingston Avenue (Ros 3) Roseland, NJ 07068 Kevin Murphy 401 Commerce Street Suite 1220, FL 12 Nashville, TN 37219		No (CoF Std T's & C's with vendor's contact information inserted not included pending negotiations if selected)	Yes (Proposer requests changes to: CoF Std T's&C's 1, 2, 5, 6, 11, 12, 14, 15, 17, 18; Procurement Agreement 1, 7, 10, 11; deviations noted)	93.03	not interviewed	\$0.220 \$0.025 \$0.220	net 30 days	90 days from release, 6/15/2016
Unum Nashville Sales & Service Office 2555 Meridian Blvd. Suite 150 Franklin, TN 37067 Mike Federle / Account Executive 615/238-9812 MFederle@unum.com		Yes	Proposer indicated no exceptions taken but proposer requests changes to: RFP: 11.h, k, q, 12.1; CoF Std T's&C's 1, 3, 5, 11, 12, 14, 15, 17. Proposer-provided information on CoF Std T's&C's was incomplete.	92.84	not interviewed	\$0.200 \$0.050 \$0.200	net 30 days	6/30/2016

*Shaded submittal is the submittal scored highest by the interview team